



Internal Audit Report

2021-01 – VOTRAN

Jonathan P. Edwards, CIA, CPFO
Internal Auditor
123 West Indiana Avenue
Deland, Florida 32720

February 12, 2021

Table of Contents

Audit Letter	1
Background	2
Scope and Methodologies	3
Evaluation	4
Findings, Concerns, and Recommendations	5
Findings:	
1. Fare Box and Bus Pass Controls Are Lacking	5
2. Policy and Procedures Over Fare Box Audits and Repairs Needed	12
3. Controls Over Invoicing and Receivables Are Lacking	16
4. Policy and Procedures Handbook Needs Updating	17
Concerns:	
1. Sales Tax Charged on Purchasing Card and Catering Policy Needed	18
2. Direct and Indirect Costs for Grants and Title VI Enhancements	19
3. Shop Tools Sign In / Out Log Not Utilized	21
4. 2-Part Receipt Book Used and Checks Not Always Endorsed Immediately	21
5. Management Reports and Capabilities of System-Reports Should Be Reviewed	22
6. Foreign Coins Not Accepted by Banks Sitting in Money Room Not Deposited or Sold	23
Appendix 1 – Bus Pass and Bus Token Review	24
Exhibit 1.A. Detail by Bus Pass and Token Review	24
Exhibit 1.B. Common Bus Pass and Token Log Issues	25
Appendix 2 – Fare Box Audit Analysis	26
Exhibit 2.A. Fare Box Audits – Actual versus Reported Analysis	26
Exhibit 2.B. Fare Box Audits – Vehicle Listing by Month	29
Exhibit 2.C. Fare Box Audits – Vehicle Listing by Day of Week	31



Internal Auditor

February 12, 2021

Honorable Members of the County Council and County Manager

Ladies and Gentlemen:

I am pleased to present audit report 2021-01 Votran. The objective of this audit was to provide information to Council and the County Manager an evaluation on Votran's operations and that business processes are in compliance with relevant laws and regulations. The period audited was Fiscal Year 2020 (October 1, 2019 through September 30, 2020).

I conducted this audit in accordance with the International Standards for the *Professional Practice of Internal Auditing*, except for the requirement of an external quality control review. Those standards require that I plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for my findings and conclusions based on audit objectives. I believe that the evidence obtained provides reasonable basis for my findings and conclusions. The audit was performed in the months of September 2020 through January 2021.

I appreciate the assistance of the staff involved that work for Votran for their support during this audit.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Jonathan Edwards".

Jonathan Edwards, CIA, CPFO
Internal Auditor

Background

Votran is a countywide transportation system providing bus service as well as transportation for the physically challenged. Votran was created in 1975 to provide transportation throughout the County. Votran provides transportation to the majority of urban and rural areas of the county with a revenue-producing fleet of 82 fixed route buses and 76 paratransit vehicles. There are almost 2,500 bus stops throughout the County. Votran has approximately 215 drivers and the remaining 65 employees work in the maintenance, dispatch, customer service, and administrative support departments.

Since first operating in 1975, the County utilized McDonald Transit, purchased by RATP DEV in 2018, to provide professional transportation management. In 2019, the County released a request for proposal (RFP) for a transportation management system. On February 4, 2020, County Council approved First Transit to provide operational management starting in August of 2020.

The budget for fiscal year (FY) 2020, which runs from October 1, 2019 through September 30, 2020, is funded by passenger fares (14%), transfer from the County General Fund (45%) and Federal and State grants (41%). During FY 2020 Votran was awarded Federal Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security (CARES) Act grant monies of \$22 million to offset operating costs normally subsidized by the General Fund due to COVID-19. The CARES Act money reduced the transfer from the General Fund to 29% for FY 2020. The CARES Act monies will be carried over and utilized during FY 2021.

Votran provides paratransit service, known as “Gold Service,” to customers who, because of a disability, are unable to use the fixed-route service. Assisting devices such as wheelchair lifts and lowered steps for easy boarding access meet requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Votran also provides a “call first” curb-to-curb service called “FLEX” which serves a dedicated area with limited stops in the New Smyrna Beach area. The FLEX bus is a paratransit vehicle with a seating capacity of 18 passengers. The service is available on the beachside and mainland. It connects with certain Votran routes in the New Smyrna Beach area.

Customers may purchase bus passes or single-ride tokens on the vehicles, online, from certain county libraries, certain tag offices, Votran’s administrative office, or the transfer plaza. Bus passes are available for 1 day, 3 days, 7 days, or 31 days. Bus tokens are available for single-rides. Prices for passes and tokens are listed online, on vehicles, and at sale locations. Reduced fares are available for qualifying passengers based on age or persons with disabilities.

In recent years ridership was approximately 3.5 million passengers per year. Due to COVID-19, ridership decreased to 2.6 million during FY 2020. Passenger counts are expected to return to pre-COVID-19 levels as vaccinations occur and the economy can fully reopen. Additionally, management is currently updating their 10-year transit development plan which provides a guide for development of the transit system over the next decade. Management will update the plan with the most current census data. They will also be seeking public input and will be holding surveys, workshops, interviews and public comment. The plan will be updated by December 31, 2021.

Scope and Methodologies

On May 5, 2020, County Council approved the 2020 Audit Plan, which included auditing Votran. The purpose of the audit was to gain a reasonable degree of assurance that the control environment surrounding Votran is based upon sound business processes and ensures that associated activities are conducted efficiently and effectively, while maintaining compliance with relevant laws, rules, and regulations.

The audit scope include all financial transactions during FY 2020 (October 1, 2019 through September 30, 2020).

Specific audit objectives were:

1. To obtain an understanding of internal controls that are significant to Votran.
2. To perform procedures that will provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with resolutions passed by Council and guidelines that have been established relating to Votran.
3. To perform procedures that will provide reasonable assurance that revenues received by the County General Fund, bus fares, and grantors were allocated, disbursed, tracked, and reported correctly.
4. To perform procedures that will provide reasonable assurance that expenditures were approved, acquired, tracked, and are appropriate.
5. To perform procedures that will evaluate the economy, efficiency, and effectiveness of Votran.
6. To perform procedures to provide a reasonable assurance that compliance with granting agencies were followed.

Audit procedures to accomplish these objectives included the following:

- Obtained and reviewed resolutions, Federal and State grant regulations, program guidelines, county and department policies and procedures, and other relevant documentation pertaining to Votran.
- Reviewed prior audit and quality assurance review findings, suggestions, recommendations, and management's corrective action plans.
- Reviewed and understood internal controls over the following areas:
 - Accounting and financial reporting
 - Cash management
 - Accounts receivables
 - Capital assets and inventory
 - Purchasing
 - Purchasing cards
 - Human resources and payroll
 - Information technology
 - Fare box and bus pass revenues
 - Fuel management
 - Maintenance
 - Claims management and safety
 - Grants management
 - ADA compliance
 - Title VI compliance
 - Dispatch operations
- Tested controls over receivables, expenditures, purchasing cards, and fare box audits.

By using a mix of statistical and non-statistical sampling techniques, the audit consisted of substantive testing of controls over the following areas:

Item	Number of Transactions in Sample	Total Amount in Sample	Number of Transactions in Population	Total Amount in Population	% of Sample to Population, Number of Transactions	% of Sample to Population, Amount
Receivables	15	\$ 22,441	400	\$ 214,154	3.8%	10.5%
Expenditures*	30	1,911,277	17,471	13,605,956	0.1%	14.0%
Purchasing cards	20	9,493	319	67,614	6.3%	14.0%
Fare box audits**	16	568	1,145	2,594	1.4%	21.9%

* The totals in this category excludes employee salary and fringe expenditures.

** For Fare box audits, the dollar amounts listed in the sample and population columns are the absolute value as there were overages and shortages identified in the fare box audits performed by Votran staff. The cumulative dollar amount of all overages and shortages was \$1,649 between what was actually collected versus the amount reported.

Evaluation

Based on the results of the audit, there are opportunities for improvement for strengthening internal controls to adequately safeguard Votran assets and prevent or detect errors and irregularities. Job duties of the accounting clerk are not separated and mitigating controls, such as documented supervisor reviews, have not been established. Controls in the money room where bus fares are counted can be enhanced to ensure the security of bus fares are not vulnerable to theft. Spreadsheets used to track bus passes and tokens contained several errors and do not have input-error checking formulas to alert the clerk, nor are the spreadsheets reviewed by someone other than the clerk.

Management conducts a random audit of five fixed-route fare boxes each day to ensure fare boxes are working correctly and that revenues are being reported accurately. However, there is not a policy or procedure of how quickly fare boxes should be repaired and who should be notified if the audit reveals an issue. Random audits of Votran paratransit vehicle fare boxes are not performed.

Controls over customer invoicing and receivables can be further developed to ensure passes and tickets are paid timely and accurately. The policy and procedures handbook over areas such as general accounting should be either created or be updated and periodically reviewed.

Findings, Concerns, and Recommendations

Findings are defined as frequent or commonly seen observations during an audit. They include critical and major failures in a program where requirements have not been effectively implemented or where there are significant issues.

Concerns are defined as infrequent or isolated observations during an audit. They include minor failures in a program where requirements have been met but opportunities may exist for improvement.

FINDINGS:

1. FARE BOX AND BUS PASS CONTROLS ARE LACKING

1.A. JOB DUTIES ARE NOT SEGREGATED

An accounting clerk has control of all phases of the bus pass and token process with little or no documentation of supervisory or third-party review. The clerk performs the following job duties:

- Printing and Inventory of Bus Passes and Tokens
 - Orders passes and tokens from the printing company
 - Receives the passes and tokens from the printing company and places them into a locked area
 - Approves invoices to pay the printing company
 - Locked storage area has only recently been locked; previously passes and tokens were in a room with access to several employees
 - Tracking and log sheet of stored passes and tokens was used for re-ordering purposes and did not include detail such as pass and token numbers
 - Performs periodic inventory count throughout the year
 - Clerk is considered the “custodian” of the passes and tokens
- Invoicing Customers and Tracking Receivable Balances
 - Customers, such as hospitals and certain non-profit organizations, call or email the clerk to place an order of passes and tokens
 - Clerk pulls requested number of passes or tokens from the storage area and creates an invoice. The clerk either mails the passes or tokens to the customer or gathers them for customer pick-up
 - Clerk maintains customer receivable listing, such as an aging report
 - Clerk receives customer payments from the mail and records payment
 - Clerk processes online orders and pulls the requested number of passes or tokens for customer pick-up or to be mailed out
- Counting and Depositing of Money Collections
 - Clerk is one of two main employees allowed into the money room to count cash collected from buses and checks from other pass or token sales
 - Clerk prepares deposit and assists getting cash and coins ready for deposit pickup by armored vehicle
 - Clerk finalizes deposit records and sends to the County Accounting division to match deposit records with the general ledger

By not segregating job duties adequately makes Votran more susceptible to intentional wrongdoing. Job duties should be adequately assigned to eliminate instances in which someone could engage in theft or other fraudulent activities by having an excessive amount of control over a process. In essence, three general functions in a process should be split among different people: physical custody of an asset, record keeping for the asset, and authorization to acquire or dispose of the asset.

Segregating job duties makes it more difficult for intentional wrongdoing because it requires collusion of two or more individuals. Segregation of duties is more difficult to accomplish in smaller areas where there are too few people to effectively shift tasks to different people. Additionally, shifting tasks among too many people may make the process less efficient. However, mitigating controls, such as documented supervisory or third-party reviews will lessen the control deficiency.

RECOMMENDATION:

Review the job tasks performed by the clerk and establish appropriate segregation of duties. Establish supervision of the tasks performed by the clerk by someone independent of the process, such as a supervisor.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree. We have started the review of the job tasks of the Accounting Clerk. We will segregate the duties of the Accounting Clerk to enhance controls of the pass and fare box revenue. Other personnel will be assigned tasks to strengthen the segregation of duties. In addition, the Finance Director or designee, will conduct supervisory oversight on the fare box and pass process of all employees involved.

1.B. MONEY ROOM CONTROLS CAN BE ENHANCED

Controls over the money room where bus fares are counted and prepared for deposit can be enhanced.

1.B.1 DAILY LISTING OF PARATRANSIT VEHICLES NOT GIVEN TO CASH COUNTERS

Dispatch does not provide a daily count of paratransit vehicles in service for the day to the cash counters to ensure all fare boxes from paratransit vehicles are included in the daily deposit. The number of paratransit vehicles varies by day depending on passenger demand.

By not providing a count or listing of paratransit vehicles on the road for each day, the cash collected in the fare boxes may not be deposited timely and are subject to theft.

RECOMMENDATION:

Provide a listing from Dispatch to the cash counters of all paratransit fare boxes deployed for the day to ensure all fare boxes are included in the cash count.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree. Dispatch has started providing a daily listing to money room staff of paratransit buses deployed for that day's run and the boxes pulled. This will ensure all boxes have been pulled and accounted.

1.B.2 ENHANCEMENTS NEEDED TO MONEY ROOM PROCEDURES TO TIGHTEN SECURITY OVER COUNTING

Cash counters do not always wear Votran-supplied aprons while inside the money room; at times these same employees will empty the trash receptacles located inside the money room; the safe inside the money room is not always locked; and at times there may only be one employee inside the money room.

Staff may voluntarily wear Votran-supplied aprons while counting cash and coins from the fare boxes which protect the employees from unclean money. However, employees are not required to wear aprons. Employees have the opportunity to place money in their pockets when they are not wearing aprons.

Trash receptacles located inside the money room will sometimes be emptied by the custodian and other times by the cash counters. Cash could be placed in the trash receptacles and then retrieved later when it is taken out of the money room and outside the view of security cameras.

The safe inside the money room, when kept between digits 0 and 10 does not lock or require a combination to be entered. It was noted and confirmed with staff that the safe is normally kept between 0 and 10 so that cash counters do not have to enter a combination. The safe combination is kept by the finance director in a secure location and also at a clerk's desk but not in a secure location. Additionally, the safe combination is not changed on a periodic basis. The money room is secured with badge-only access and is limited to select employees; however, the safe is susceptible to unauthorized access.

Policy requires that at least two employees be in the money room at the same time. However, when the armored vehicle arrives to pick-up the deposit, only one employee accesses and enters the money room to retrieve the deposit. Allowing only one employee in the money room, even for one instance, opens the perception and acceptance that an employee can go into the money room at any time without raising suspicions.

There are security cameras in the money room as well as throughout the Votran campus. The security cameras views were observed to ensure that angles captured the money room appropriately. However, cameras are not monitored at all times due to the cost of hiring security personnel. The cameras are used by management more as preventative and investigative means.

Mitigating controls can be implemented that are lower in costs which will lessen the likelihood of theft, especially in the money room.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- a. Require staff, while inside the money room, at all times to wear aprons that restrict access to their pockets.
- b. Prohibit the removal of trash or other containers from the cash room by cash counters.
- c. Ensure the safe requires a combination every time it is closed, that those who possess the combination maintain it in a secure location, and that the combination be changed periodically.
- d. Require at least two employees, at all times, be in the money room.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree.

- a. *Management will review and establish the requirements for aprons usage in the money room. The aprons will be used to restrict access to the pockets on the counters' clothing.*
- b. *Cans will be removed by janitorial/maintenance staff after the money has been picked up by armored car.*
- c. *We have ordered a new safe for the money room that will allow for combinations to be changed on a periodic basis.*
- d. *We have changed the access to the money room to require two employees to log in to gain access to money room. We also will be adding more cameras into the money room for better coverage.*

1.B.3 LACK OF DOCUMENTED SUPERVISORY OR SURPRISE REVIEWS

Only the cash counters count and prepare the deposit with no documented or surprise reviews.

The probability of collusion between cash counters is significantly increased by not conducting surprise or periodic reviews by a supervisor, or someone who is independent of the process. If employees suspect that their work will be reviewed and verified, they are less likely to embezzle and conceal revenues.

RECOMMENDATION:

Review and document, on a periodic and surprise basis, the cash counted to the deposit totals to ensure cash is accurately being received and recorded.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and the Finance Director, or designee, will make periodic surprise cash counts and reconciliations.

1.B.4 NOT ALL MONEY IS STORED IN MONEY ROOM OVERNIGHT

Money collected from the front desk, the transfer station, and the day's mail is not kept in the safe inside the money room. Instead, these monies are maintained in a small locked canister overnight at the clerk's desk.

The accounting office area is not locked or closed-off during non-office hours and non-office employees could be walking through the area. The area is within view of security cameras but camera footage is not viewed by security staff at all times.

RECOMMENDATION:

Store all money received by the end of the business day in the safe inside the money room, which has limited access to only a few employees.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and all money will be stored and locked inside the safe in the Finance Director's office. A new safe is being ordered for the Finance Director. The Finance Director or designee will have combination to the safe.

1.C. BUS PASS AND BUS TOKEN LOG SHEETS CONTAINED SEVERAL ERRORS & NOT ISSUED SEQUENTIALLY

Bus passes and tokens are not issued in sequential order and tracking logs that are used contain considerable amount of typographical input errors, including the quantity of tickets sold to customers.

The clerk utilizes spreadsheets to track issuance of bus passes and bus tokens. When a customer, the transfer station, or front desk requests additional passes and tokens, the clerk enters the tickets into a spreadsheet. Customers, such as healthcare agencies, will request large quantities at a time. Whereas other customers request smaller quantities. Depending on the request size, the clerk pulls passes and tokens from different stacks.

One partner agency purchases bus passes and tokens from Votran on behalf of the State of Florida to provide transportation to people with physical and mental disabilities. The agency then bills the State for used passes and tokens. However, the agency typically returns unused passes and tokens back to Votran. The accounting clerk did not record these returns in the respective log sheets. However, the clerk reported them as being sold again to another party. By not recording these returns in the log sheet, it appears that tickets are sold twice and could lead to tickets being used in a fraudulent manner.

At times, the clerk failed to record the pass or token sale into the log. Other times, the quantity sold to the customer did not agree with the ticket number sequence (beginning ticket number and ending ticket number).

Due to the scale of errors and potential for theft, all bus passes and tokens sold during FY 2020 were reviewed. During the first step of the review a total of 64,806 passes and tokens with a value of

\$261,813 could not be verified. The results were shared with management. Management then provided other documentation such as signed customer receipts and verified correct quantities sold. After this second review the number of passes and tokens that could not be verified were 513 with a value of \$1,442. The largest discrepancy was due to the printing company who skipped number sequencing by 30,000. The clerk did not document this discrepancy and was unaware until the auditor questioned it.

During FY 2020, a total of 152,049 passes and tokens were sold with a value of \$988,907. A summary of the bus pass and token logs is below.

	First Step Review Not Verified	First Step Review Not Verified	Second Step Review Not Verified	Second Step Review Not Verified	Total Sold During FY 2020	Total Sold During FY 2020	% Not Verified by Auditor	% Not Verified by Auditor
	Count	Value	Count	Value	Count	Value	Count	Value
Passes	46,829	\$ 210,571	44	\$ 411	75,822	\$ 785,590	0.06%	0.05%
Tokens	17,977	51,242	469	1,031	76,227	203,317	0.62%	0.51%
Total	64,806	\$ 261,813	513	\$ 1,442	152,049	\$ 988,907	0.34%	0.15%

Common ticket issues that were noted included typographical errors, tickets not recorded in the log, and inconsistent quantity in the log versus what was given to the customer according to signed receipts. A summary of common ticket issues follows.

	Typographical Errors in Log	Not Recorded in Log	Inconsistent Quantity in Log versus Given	Total Common Log Issues	Total Log Entries	% of Common Log Issues of the Total Log Entries
Passes	28	44	14	86	1,810	4.75%
Tokens	33	68	34	135	1,170	11.54%
Total	61	112	48	221	2,980	7.42%

Included in Appendix 1 is a detail listing of all the bus pass and tokens.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- a) Revise log sheets to include input error-checking formulas to detect and alert for typographical errors, out-of-sequence sales, and agreement of quantity sold with the number of tickets in the sale.
- b) Disburse bus passes and tokens in sequential order.
- c) Record returned bus passes and tokens in the log to properly track all bus passes and tokens and work with the partner agency to reduce the number of returns.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree.

- a. Log sheets have been revised.*
- b. Bus passes and tokens will be disbursed in sequential order.*
- c. Returned passes/tokens is being logged in by the Accounting Clerk. We will ask partner agencies to only order the amount of passes/tokens they plan to use for the period of time. We will monitor those agencies who return a large amount of passes/tokens and work to reduce the order. Returned passes/tokens will not be re-issued.*

1.D. BUS PASS AND BUS TOKENS INVENTORY CONTROLS LACKING

Inventory of bus passes and tokens are performed sporadically, performed by the accounting clerk with no supervisory review, and tracking sheets only list the number of boxes of passes and tokens in stock.

Unused and ready to sell bus passes and tokens are stored in a locked storage area, limited to very few employees. However, this was changed a few months prior to the start of the audit. Previously, the passes and tokens were stored in a room with access to several employees. Votran policy requires that a physical count, or inventory, be performed on a monthly basis. The number of physical counts performed by staff by fiscal year is below:

Fiscal Year	Number of Counts
FY 2020	5
FY 2019	7
FY 2018	6

The accounting clerk is the custodian of the stock and also performs the physical count of stock. The inventory is not supervised or performed by someone other than the custodian. The inventory tracking sheets only list the number of boxes in the storage area and does not list the serial numbers of passes and tokens. The accounting clerk used the listing as a device to reorder stock when it became low and not to maintain security or accountability of the bus passes and tokens.

On September 30, 2020, the auditor performed a physical count of bus passes and tokens located in the storage area and at the accounting clerk's desk. The details of the results were:

Bus Pass and Token Type	Count	Value
1 Day Full	38,500	\$ 144,375.00
1 Day Reduced	8,784	16,250.40
3 Day Full	1,841	13,807.50
3 Day Reduced	1,049	3,933.75
7 Day Full	10,129	131,677.00
7 Day Reduced	5,570	36,205.00
31 Day Full	7,331	337,226.00
31 Day Reduced	7,751	178,273.00
Full Fare Token	5,369	9,395.75
Reduced Token	5,674	4,822.90
GOLD	65,408	196,224.00
7-Day Special	3,002	39,026.00
Total	160,408	\$ 1,111,216.30

A total of 160,408 passes and tokens were counted with a value of \$1,111,216.30. Given the number and value of the passes and tokens, it is essential that they be counted and inventoried on a monthly basis to reduce the risk of errors and shortages. There is higher risk of undetected inventory errors and concealment of shortages when there is a lack of segregation of duties and supervisory oversight, lack of monthly and independent physical inventories, and a lack of reconciliation of physical inventory counts to the corresponding records.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- a) Ensure physical inventory of bus passes and tokens are performed monthly, documented, and reviewed by an independent person.
- b) Include the serial number of the bus passes and tokens on the tracking spreadsheet for accountability.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree. A monthly inventory will be conducted and documented of all passes and tokens along with a tracking of all serial numbers. We will assign different personnel to stock the passes and another to do the actual physical count.

2. POLICY & PROCEDURES OVER FARE BOX AUDITS AND REPAIRS NEEDED

2.A. FIXED-ROUTE FARE BOX REPAIR POLICY NEEDED

Policies and procedures are not in place so when fare boxes are noted with inaccurate money counts, maintenance staff are not notified and a policy does not exist on how quickly repairs should be completed.

The fixed-route buses have automated fare box systems reporting the revenue collected for the day. When the buses are finished on their routes for the day, the "roll-in" procedure is for a supervisor to disengage the fare box collection system from the bus. The supervisor takes the fare box and empties

the contents into an opening in the building's wall that only the fare box device can fit into. The money is emptied and falls into a locked and secured holding bin that can only be opened from inside the money room. Due to the large number of vehicles in service on a daily basis and the small number of cash counters, it is not efficient to separate out each fare box for a separate count. Instead, all but five random boxes are emptied into the same space. The five random fare boxes are set aside and counted separately. Staff perform these audits to ensure fare boxes are reporting correctly and that there are not ongoing maintenance issues with the fare boxes.

The five random fare boxes that are counted separately each day are used to determine if the amount reported by the automated fare boxes agrees with the actual amount counted. There is not a policy or a formal procedure in place to alert the maintenance department of fare boxes not reporting accurately within an accepted threshold or for the fare box to be reviewed by a technician within a certain number of days.

Staff indicated that older fare boxes have difficulty reading \$5 bills and that multiples of 5, if under \$15, is not sent to the maintenance department.

Staff track the date of the fare box audit, the bus number, and the amount over/short. During FY 2020, there were 1,145 random audits performed by Votran staff. The difference between what was reported and the actual amount collected summed an absolute value of \$2,594. For these 1,145 random audits, the system reported fare revenue of \$79,121 with actual amount counted by staff totaling \$80,770, or a cumulative positive variance of \$1,649. This is a 2.08% positive variance between reported revenues and actual revenues.

Staff provided the auditor with maintenance records which were compared to the date of the fare box audit to determine the number of days between the audit and the service date. The auditor reviewed audits conducted with a \$15 variance or higher. There were a total of 16 of these instances. It was an average of 36 days between the date audited and the date a maintenance technician reviewed the bus's fare box (the longest being 103 days and the shortest being 1 day).

It was noted that fare box audits were consistent by month as well as the days of the week. Appendix 2 contains three reports that includes total of amount collected versus amount reported by each vehicle, list the number of audits by days of the week, and the number of audits by month for FY 2020.

The results are summarized on the following page.

Bus Number	Date Audited	Actual over / (short) counted from Report Total	Date Maintenance Technician Reviewed	Number of Days Between Audit and Service	Comments
1907	10/28/2019	\$ 21.74	12/14/2019	47	From 10/28/19 through 12/14/19, was audited 4 other times with differences of \$5, \$8, \$5, and \$0.
1709	11/30/2019	(91.00)	12/23/2019	23	No audits were performed and there were no service records between these dates.
1902	12/6/2019	37.20	12/7/2019	1	Audited on 12/9/19 with \$0.05 difference.
1909	12/10/2019	15.09	1/3/2020	24	From 12/10/19 and 1/3/20, was audited 1 other time with difference of \$6.23.
1901	12/13/2019	18.35	2/24/2020	73	From 12/13/19 through 2/24/20, was audited 6 other times with differences of \$8, \$4, \$4, \$4, and (\$2.80).
1801	1/10/2020	19.66	3/5/2020	55	Bus was not audited from 1/10/20 through 7/1/20.
2503	2/7/2020	92.25	2/12/2020	5	No audits were performed and there were no service records between these dates.
2404	3/26/2020	22.05	6/25/2020	91	From 3/26/20 through 6/25/20, was audited 3 other times with differences of \$0, \$0.25, and \$0.10.
2208	6/6/2020	15.24	6/19/2020	13	No audits were performed and there were no service records between these dates.
1903	7/17/2020	30.00	7/22/2020	5	Audited on 7/25/20 with a difference of \$1.20.
2207	7/18/2020	31.29	7/24/2020	6	No audits were performed and there were no service records between these dates.
2608	7/20/2020	(30.00)	8/10/2020	21	From 7/20/20 through 8/10/20 was audited 1 other time with difference of \$0.00.
1801	9/4/2020	23.80	10/4/2020	30	Audited on 9/22/20 with \$5.00 difference.
1903	9/5/2020	87.50	10/7/2020	32	Audited on 9/14/20 with \$0.00 difference.
1905	9/17/2020	15.00	12/29/2020	103	Maintenance reviewed on 9/16/20 (day before the audit) but not serviced again until 12/29/20.
2204	9/19/2020	18.00	11/3/2020	45	No audits were performed and there were no service records between these dates.

Causes of the errors could be from malfunction of the fare box, the driver not using the correct procedures when passengers are boarding, passenger error, or potential theft from either passengers or drivers.

Neither First Transit nor Votran have an accepted or documented variance threshold or benchmark of reported fare revenues versus counted fares. The former management company had a policy of 1% or less.

Fare revenues that are not monitored or benchmarked, may lead to issues with fare boxes not being properly maintained, theft of fare revenues, or other issues regarding fare boxes and drivers. Additionally, ongoing and inaccurate revenue reporting may also lead to loss of future grants. Fare revenues are considered program income for grant purposes and are subtracted in grant reimbursements. Understating program income in grant reimbursements is not allowed.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- a) Develop policy and procedures that defines the dollar amount variance threshold to be reported; including who should be notified; the number of days the fare box should be reviewed by a maintenance technician; how often fare boxes should be compared to actual money counted; and, if errors are caused by drivers, how frequently drivers should be retrained or other disciplinary actions, as appropriate.
- b) Determine and set an acceptable variance percentage to benchmark reported fares versus actual fares. Management should review the performance to this benchmark on a periodic basis.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree.

- a. *We have adopted a policy that requires any variances in excess of five dollars be reported to operation and maintenance departments to investigate the variances found. Operations and maintenance will report back to finance within 5 days of their investigations of corrective action taken. This documentation will be kept with the fare box audit for that day.*
- b. *Votran has established no more than a plus or minus 2% variance for the month as an acceptable variance for the month for fixed route fare boxes. Any variance in excess of 2% will be reviewed to determine the contributing factors and appropriate corrective action will be taken to minimize the cause of the variances.*

2.B. RANDOM FARE BOX AUDITS OF PARATRANSIT VEHICLES NOT PERFORMED

Random fare box audits of Votran paratransit vehicles are not conducted by staff. By not conducting random audits, fare revenues may be stolen, inaccurately reported, or improperly overridden by the drivers.

Fare revenues that are not monitored or benchmarked, may lead to issues with fare boxes not being properly maintained, theft of fare revenues, or other issues regarding fare boxes and drivers. Additionally, ongoing and inaccurate revenue reporting may also lead to loss of future grants. Fare revenues are considered program income for grant purposes and are subtracted in grant reimbursements. Understating program income in grant reimbursements is not allowed.

RECOMMENDATION:

Implement random fare box audits of the Votran paratransit vehicles similar to the fixed-route random audit process.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and are in the process of developing procedures that will allow for the random audit of paratransit fare boxes by adopting a reconciliation procedure that uses the daily manifest. This will also be reviewed by County staff.

3. CONTROLS OVER INVOICING AND RECEIVABLES ARE LACKING

3.A. CUSTOMER INVOICES CREATED WITH SPREADSHEETS AND INVOICES ARE NOT ALWAYS NUMBERED

Staff utilize spreadsheets to create, track, and post bus passes and tokens sold to non-profit agencies. However, the use of spreadsheets does not allow for automatic invoice generation, proper tracking, and data can easily be overwritten or lost. Additionally, not all invoices contain numbers, such as FedEx and mail orders.

Data is organized in tabs within the spreadsheet by month and outstanding balances are copied and pasted into the next month's tab. In a test of 15 invoices paid in FY 2020, there were 2 that did not have the payment date entered, appearing that the customer did not pay the invoice, when in fact, they had made payment.

Best practices of invoicing is using an accounts receivable system's capabilities to generate pre-numbered invoices and to post payments which reduces the opportunity for lost or overwritten data. This will also assist in ensuring transactions are captured and recorded in the financial records.

RECOMMENDATION:

Consider utilizing an accounts receivable system for invoicing customers instead of spreadsheets and ensure all invoices are numbered by the system. If such system is deemed not feasible, consider updating the spreadsheet with formulas to check for errors and better tracking of payments.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and are reviewing billing software. In the meantime, the billing spreadsheets are being revised for tracking purposes and will be reviewed monthly by the Finance Director.

3.B. ONE CUSTOMER IS NOT PAYING PROMPTLY ON ACCOUNT BALANCES

One customer had 31 separate invoices issued during FY 2020, 11 of which were over 60 days. For example, an invoice dated 11/12/19 was not paid for 317 days. During this same time period, 22 additional invoices were issued to this customer including an invoice dated on 3/13/20 which was not

paid for 187 days. Of these 22 additional invoices, 7 invoices were over \$100, averaging \$702 with an average of 48 days to pay. 4 of these invoices were over 30 days past due.

Staff indicated they do not fulfill new customer invoices until all outstanding balances have been paid.

There is not a written policy on fulfilling customer invoices until all outstanding balances have been paid. As noted earlier, in a test of 15 invoices paid in FY 2020, there were 2 that did not have the payment date entered, appearing that the customer did not pay the invoice, when in fact, they had made payment. There is not a documented review of an aging receivables account report.

Unpaid and outstanding customer balances may lead to loss of revenues and cash flow. Written policies ensure management's directives are clearly understood by employees.

RECOMMENDATION:

Develop a written policy regarding invoicing and following up on customer accounts receivables and whether or not to release bus passes or tokens on past due accounts. Include in the policy that customer balances longer than a certain time frame, i.e., 90 days, that dunning letters will be mailed to customers.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree. A written policy will be developed concerning past due accounts receivable that will entail a monthly report of all past due accounts will be generated. In the policy, we will determine the appropriate time frame for letters to be sent. The Finance Director and the General Manager will review the list and determine the appropriate response.

4. POLICY AND PROCEDURES HANDBOOK NEEDS UPDATING

There is no documentation of significant policies and up-to-date detailed procedures in the form of a handbook or manual for some areas, including: general accounting, capital assets and inventory, and fuel management.

By not having written policies and procedures, staff may not understand the process and may lead to errors or fraudulent activities. Best practices on accounting policy and procedures handbooks, including from the Government Finance Officers Association (GFOA), state that illustrations or examples of source documents used should be included within handbooks, be readily available to all employees who need it, and delineate the authority and responsibility of employees, especially those authorizing transactions and responsibility of safekeeping of assets and records. Additionally, such handbooks should be reviewed and updated periodically.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- a) Update and create a handbook that documents accounting policies and procedures that delineates the authority and responsibility of all employees, especially the authority to authorize transactions and the responsibility for the safekeeping of assets and records.
- b) Include source documents used such as illustrations and indicate which employees are to perform which procedures.
- c) Explain in the handbook the design and purpose of control-related procedures to increase the understanding and support for controls and be readily available to all employees who need it.
- d) Review the handbook no less than every three years and promptly update it when changes in processes occur.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and will work to develop written accounting policies and procedures. We will develop policies for Revenue, Cash Handling, Credit Cards, General Accounting, Invoicing, Fare Box Process, Processing of Expenses, Capital Assets, Inventory, Fuel, Bank Account Reconciliation, and Financial Reporting.

CONCERNS:

1. SALES TAX CHARGED ON PURCHASING CARD AND CATERING POLICY NEEDED

1.A. SALES TAX ON PURCHASING CARD

1 transaction on a purchasing card (of 20 tested) was charged sales tax of \$10.63 on a purchase of items totaling \$177.10. During FY 2020 there were a total of 319 purchasing card transactions, totaling \$63,614. 20 transactions were tested, totaling \$9,493. In a separate expenditure test of 30 transactions, which totaled over \$1.9 million, sales tax was not noted as being improperly charged.

Florida statutes exempt state sales tax from official business purchases.

RECOMMENDATION:

Retrain employees on sales tax exemption and ensure sales tax is not charged.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and employees will be retrained and understand the necessity of the sales tax exemption form. We have implemented a new tracking form for purchasing card review.

1.B. CATERING POLICY NEEDED

The cost of catering food for the 2020 Votran awards banquet was \$40 per guest. There were 225 planned guest for the event and cost \$9,000 for catering services. The cost for catering this event was compared to other county events during FY 2019 and FY 2020. The average cost of catering for such events of 100 guests or more was roughly \$29.00 per guest.

There is not a county-wide policy for departments or divisions on acceptable catering costs per guests. Without a policy, departments may not have a sense of appropriate and acceptable amounts to be spent on recognition events.

RECOMMENDATION:

Develop a policy that advises departments on the acceptable amount to be spent on recognition and other dinner events, including catering.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and the County is developing a policy regarding employee events, such as recognition and award ceremonies, to ensure that rates and charges are not excessive. Subsequent to adoption, these rates will be reviewed at least every three years to adjust for inflation, if necessary.

2. DIRECT AND INDIRECT COSTS FOR GRANTS AND TITLE VI ENHANCEMENTS

2.A. FUEL COSTS CHARGED TO GRANT INCORRECTLY

Approximately \$11,000 of County Emergency Medical Service's Ambulatory (EVAC) vehicle fuel usage was incorrectly included on a grant reimbursement. EVAC utilizes Votran's fuel station on the Westside of the County to fuel their ambulances. Votran pays the fuel vendor for the fuel used and then bills EVAC for their portion of the cost. Votran staff did not deduct the EVAC reimbursement on grant request during FY 2020. After being notified of the error, staff coordinated with the grantor and deducted the amount on a future grant reimbursement.

In another instance, a manual paycheck was issued to an employee of approximately \$1,500 that was journalized into the general ledger after the grant reimbursement had already been sent to the grantors for the month. The manual paycheck would have been an allowable expenditure to the grantor.

Charging non-Votran related expenditures to grantors is not allowable per grant agreements. Conversely, efforts should be made to maximize proper grant reimbursements and include proper expenditures when allowable.

RECOMMENDATION:

Reconcile monthly grant submissions to the general ledger to ensure all allowable expenditures are captured for maximum grant reimbursements and that any non-allowable expenditures are not included.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and have taken steps to ensure all general ledger transactions are being reviewed by the Finance Director and General Manager for billing eligibility. Issue has been resolved and all future submissions will be reviewed.

2.B. COST ALLOCATION PLAN NEEDED

A formal, documented cost allocation plan (CAP) has not been developed to charge certain costs in an effort to maximize grant reimbursements. Certain operating costs (such as supplies and insurance) that are covered by grants should be included in a formal, documented CAP to increase and support the amount of the direct costs that is billed to grantors. Certain direct and indirect expenditures are ultimately factored into the approved rate billed per trip with a formal CAP identifying supporting documentation for actual time incurred for specific grant operations. The formal plan should identify the source of the shared costs and the methodology for allocating those costs. Supporting documentation should be maintained and available to support the costs, including timesheets or other evidence of actual time incurred on operations.

By not having a formal documented plan, grant revenues may not be maximized. Conversely, not having a documented plan may lead to inconsistencies in applying and documenting indirect costs which could lead to overstating indirect costs which may result in a loss of future grant revenue.

RECOMMENDATION:

Develop a formal CAP that supports methodology for allocations to grant funding sources to accurately and consistently reflect indirect costs to grants meanwhile potentially increasing the amount of indirect costs to granting agencies.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and the cost allocation plan is being developed by Tindale Oliver. We expect to receive the review by the end of March. The plan will be reviewed by Votran staff working with County staff for appropriateness.

2.C. TITLE VI PROGRAM UPDATES NEEDED

The Federal Transit Authority (FTA) performed a triennial Title VI review in January 2020 with a few concerns and general comments in regards to the next Title VI program update, which is due by November 30, 2022. These areas included:

- Public notice to include how to file a Title VI complaint
- 4 factor language assistance plan used in the current plan contained outdated census data which may not reflect current demographics and how to train employees on providing timely and reasonable language assistance
- Descriptions of how policies are adopted to ensure service design and operation practices do not result in discrimination on basis of color, race, or national origin
- Votran website has areas not covered under Title VI combined with the Title VI area, which should be separated

RECOMMENDATION:

Implement concerns and general comments over Title VI area in the next program update.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and have implemented the changes with the 2020 Votran Title VI update. The Title VI program has been approved and have been issued close out letters. Votran's next Title VI submission is due to the Federal Transit Administration in December of 2022.

3. SHOP TOOLS SIGN IN / OUT LOG NOT UTILIZED

A log is not utilized to sign in or out the high-dollar shop tools, such as computers and diagnostic equipment that are used by maintenance technicians. Policy states that any major or high-dollar shop tools must be signed out by the technician using the tool. The technician, once completed with the tool, is to sign the tool in once returning it to the tool room. Upon further discussion, the maintenance director stated this policy is a goal and is working towards a sign in/out log.

Maintenance technicians routinely use tools that are high cost that are shared within the repair bays. By not having a sign in/out log, tools may be used inappropriately, damaged, lost, or stolen.

RECOMMENDATION:

Create a sign in/out log for any major or high-dollar shop tools in accordance with established policy.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree. The tool sign out policy is contained in the Maintenance Rule Book, and a sign out log has been developed, implemented, and shared with the internal auditor.

4. 2-PART RECEIPT BOOK USED AND CHECKS NOT ALWAYS ENDORSED IMMEDIATELY

A 3-part receipt book is not utilized when customers purchase bus passes or bus tokens. A 2-part receipt book is used with one part going to the customer and the other part going to the accounting clerk. The current receipt book is not pre-numbered and therefore cannot be issued in sequential order. If a 3-part book is used, the third part would remain in the receipt book and can be utilized by a supervisor or another party to review all receipts issued. This can be used to trace all sales to the deposit in an easier fashion. Additionally, it was noted that not all payments by check were immediately restrictively endorsed for deposit-only to the Votran bank account.

Best practices of receipting is to give the customer a copy of the receipt, a second copy kept with the deposit backup, and the third copy maintained in the receipt book. Payment details, customer name, description of the sale, date, and amount should be written on the receipt. This will assist in ensuring all sales are captured and recorded into the financial records. Payments received via check should be

immediately stamped with a restrictive endorsement so that checks cannot be deposited by an individual or an entity other than Votran.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- a) Purchase and use a 3-part receipt book then reconcile the receipt book to the financial records on a regular basis. Issue pre-numbered receipts in numerical order with maintaining one copy in the receipt book at all times.
- b) Ensure checks are immediately restrictively endorsed so that other individuals or entities cannot deposit the payment.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree.

- a. *We have implemented the use of numbered 3 part receipt book.*
- b. *We have reminded staff of the importance to restrictively endorse all checks received. Personnel who have responsibility for receiving checks, have been issued a "For Deposit Only" stamp.*

5. MANAGEMENT REPORTS AND CAPABILITIES OF SYSTEM-REPORTS SHOULD BE REVIEWED

Staff produce reports for management and grant reimbursement purposes that capture the number of passenger and revenues generated by each route. Two separate computer systems are used, one for fixed-routes and the other for paratransit routes, each with their own unique and needed capabilities. Staff indicate that both systems lack reporting capabilities for management and grant reporting purposes. Therefore, staff export data from these systems into spreadsheets. From there, staff partake in a tedious process to sort, filter, and summarize the data that is deemed more useful for management. Staff indicate this is a month long process. For fixed-route ridership, data is added into the spreadsheets by staff for which data is not being captured by the computer system, such as trip adjustments or route deviations.

For fixed-route reports, undefined and deadhead ridership counts and revenues are included in the Route 1 data. These numbers could be shown on a designated row and not combined with Route 1. Users of the report may be unaware that these are combined and these trips are not separately tracked for excessive counts of undefined and deadhead trips.

The revenue generated from bus fares is deducted from grant reimbursements as this is considered program income to the grantor. By including these non-revenue generating amounts, while immaterial, may be considered unallowable by the grantor.

Exporting data into a spreadsheet and then sorting and adding external data may lead to inefficient processes and has the potential for misuse or accidental deletion of data. As best possible, system-generated reports should be used or customized to obtain the information needed. If it is deemed not feasible due to cost constraints, and exporting of data is the only option available, employee training on spreadsheets should be considered to understand and maximize spreadsheet formula usage.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- a) Consider the usefulness of management reports and capabilities of system reports for grant reporting purposes. Research the possibility of developing custom reports from the system or develop spreadsheet templates with lookup and reference formulas to facilitate more efficient summary reporting. Require staff to attend Excel training to learn and understand all the formulas available to minimize manual sorting and filtering data.
- b) Modify the fixed-route report to show undefined and deadhead revenue and passenger counts on separate lines so not to distort Route 1 numbers and for better tracking of these activities.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree.

- a. *We will begin a systematic review of the various report that the system is able to produce and the spreadsheet reports that are being maintained to determine any duplication of effort that may exist and report that could be eliminated. We will look into the software to see if changes can be made to aid in the better align with grant reporting.*
- b. *The undefined and deadhead revenue will be allocated to the appropriate routes.*

6. FOREIGN COINS NOT ACCEPTED BY BANKS SITTING IN MONEY ROOM NOT DEPOSITED OR SOLD

There are four deposit bags full of foreign currency that had not been deposited or sold. The fare box system is designed to reject foreign coins from being accepted as payment. However, sometimes foreign coins are recognized and accepted by the fare box. The bank does not accept foreign coins with daily deposits. Staff have collected these coins over several years.

During the audit, staff contacted the bank for further guidance on depositing of these coins. The bank would not accept these coins. Staff also reached out to currency exchange organizations who also stated they would not accept these coins.

County Ordinance, Section 2-281 "surplus property" requires that agencies submit to the purchasing director reports of property which is no longer used or which has become obsolete, worn out or scrap. The purchasing director has the authority to dispose of all surplus property in any appropriate legal manner.

RECOMMENDATION:

Implement procedures to follow County Ordinance to include foreign currency as part of a competitive auction sale, either periodically, or, at minimum, annually.

MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE:

We agree and foreign coins have been sent to auction and will continue to do so in the future.

Appendix 1 – Bus Pass and Bus Token Review

Exhibit 1.A. Detail by Bus Pass and Token Review

As noted in 1.C. in the report, the bus pass and token log sheets contained several errors. As explained in the report, a two-step verification was performed by the auditor. A total of 513 passes and tokens, valued at \$1,442 could not be accounted. A detail listing, by pass and token type, is below. Following is a table with detail of the common log issues.

	First Step Review Not Verified	First Step Review Not Verified	Second Step Review Not Verified	Second Step Review Not Verified	Total Sold During FY 2020	Total Sold During FY 2020	% Not Verified by Auditor	% Not Verified by Auditor
	Count	Value	Count	Value	Count	Value	Count	Value
31 Day Full	367	\$ 16,882	5	\$ 230	4,841	\$ 222,686	0.10%	0.10%
31 Day Reduced	569	13,087	0	0	6,130	140,990	0.00%	0.00%
7 Day Full	1,078	14,014	4	52	17,974	233,662	0.02%	0.02%
7 Day Reduced	100	650	0	0	2,919	18,973	0.00%	0.00%
3 Day Full	1,013	7,598	1	7	3,666	27,495	0.03%	0.03%
3 Day Reduced	11	41	1	4	1,205	4,519	0.08%	0.08%
1 Day Full	40,774	152,903	30	112	34,186	128,197	0.09%	0.09%
1 Day Reduced	2,917	5,396	3	6	4,901	9,067	0.06%	0.06%
Full Fare Token	1,725	3,019	182	318	12,962	22,684	1.40%	1.40%
Reduced Token	248	211	69	59	4,261	3,622	1.62%	1.62%
GOLD Token	16,004	48,012	218	654	59,004	177,012	0.37%	0.37%
Total	64,806	\$ 261,813	513	\$ 1,442	152,049	\$ 988,907	0.34%	0.15%

Exhibit 1.B. Common Bus Pass and Token Log Issues

	Typographical Errors in Log	Not Recorded in Log	Inconsistent Quantity in Log versus Quantity Given	Total Common Log Issues	Total Log Entries	% of Common Log Issues versus the Total Log Entries
31 Day Full	8	9	2	19	660	2.88%
31 Day Reduced	5	6	4	15	349	4.30%
7 Day Full	5	5	3	13	276	4.71%
7 Day Reduced	0	1	0	1	63	1.59%
3 Day Full	0	2	1	3	92	3.26%
3 Day Reduced	1	0	0	1	24	4.17%
1 Day Full	7	16	2	25	248	10.08%
1 Day Reduced	2	5	2	9	98	9.18%
Full Fare Token	4	15	5	24	144	16.67%
Reduced Token	1	5	5	11	62	17.74%
GOLD Token	28	48	24	100	964	10.37%
Total	61	112	48	221	2,980	7.42%

Appendix 2 –Fare Box Audit Analysis *

Exhibit 2.A. Fare Box Audits – Actual versus Reported Analysis

Bus #	Actual Fares Counted	Reported Fares	Percentage Collected
1404	\$197.28	\$192.28	102.60%
1601	\$907.77	\$858.86	105.69%
1602	\$671.84	\$646.59	103.91%
1603	\$1,677.48	\$1,641.94	102.16%
1604	\$1,423.96	\$1,356.36	104.98%
1605	\$1,654.63	\$1,593.93	103.81%
1606	\$1,269.42	\$1,217.88	104.23%
1701	\$1,017.00	\$937.80	108.45%
1702	\$806.70	\$760.75	106.04%
1703	\$82.30	\$83.05	99.10%
1704	\$342.95	\$327.26	104.79%
1705	\$353.67	\$326.79	108.23%
1706	\$377.30	\$370.16	101.93%
1707	\$436.53	\$416.42	104.83%
1708	\$316.07	\$329.86	95.82%
1709	\$1,061.71	\$1,115.14	95.21%
1801	\$487.66	\$424.20	114.96%
1802	\$791.62	\$756.55	104.64%
1901	\$1,718.74	\$1,647.47	104.33%
1902	\$842.19	\$760.09	110.80%
1903	\$1,749.32	\$1,560.60	112.09%
1904	\$2,071.21	\$1,969.79	105.15%
1905	\$1,456.19	\$1,390.57	104.72%
1906	\$1,123.64	\$1,061.89	105.82%
1907	\$2,517.95	\$2,357.90	106.79%
1908	\$1,050.36	\$998.61	105.18%
1909	\$621.90	\$581.84	106.89%
2001	\$1,178.93	\$1,181.03	99.82%
2002	\$263.70	\$281.15	93.79%
2003	\$211.11	\$214.13	98.59%
2004	\$793.44	\$784.88	101.09%
2005	\$236.73	\$237.57	99.65%
2006	\$1,280.78	\$1,277.63	100.25%
2010	\$123.85	\$123.85	100.00%
2100	\$63.99	\$63.99	100.00%
2101	\$528.11	\$518.33	101.89%
2102	\$237.15	\$236.15	100.42%
2103	\$92.25	\$92.40	99.84%
2104	\$481.75	\$481.64	100.02%
2111	\$68.78	\$68.78	100.00%
2201	\$1,363.00	\$1,357.35	100.42%
2202	\$903.20	\$893.25	101.11%

* Due to COVID-19, bus fares were not collected from April 2, 2020 through May 31, 2020. As noted in 2.A in the report, the number of fare box audits is consistent from month to month as well as days of the week understanding there are less routes on Sundays.

Exhibit 2.A. Fare Box Audits – Actual versus Reported Analysis (Continued)

Bus #	Actual Fares Counted	Reported Fares	Percentage Collected
2203	\$470.38	\$480.13	97.97%
2204	\$3,865.45	\$3,839.07	100.69%
2205	\$1,113.20	\$1,109.86	100.30%
2206	\$132.75	\$132.75	100.00%
2207	\$577.28	\$547.99	105.34%
2208	\$336.98	\$317.74	106.06%
2209	\$431.04	\$437.14	98.60%
2301	\$515.72	\$511.87	100.75%
2302	\$794.94	\$794.21	100.09%
2303	\$640.31	\$639.37	100.15%
2304	\$839.22	\$839.91	99.92%
2305	\$346.60	\$346.60	100.00%
2306	\$289.51	\$284.01	101.94%
2307	\$505.07	\$502.07	100.60%
2308	\$4,492.28	\$4,472.68	100.44%
2309	\$1,970.34	\$1,959.06	100.58%
2310	\$147.96	\$136.34	108.52%
2311	\$768.20	\$761.16	100.92%
2401	\$3,964.77	\$3,957.26	100.19%
2402	\$1,193.17	\$1,194.02	99.93%
2403	\$1,046.72	\$1,046.25	100.04%
2404	\$3,181.46	\$3,129.34	101.67%
2501	\$1,135.58	\$1,136.86	99.89%
2502	\$1,198.94	\$1,189.15	100.82%
2503	\$982.01	\$887.44	110.66%
2504	\$152.20	\$152.20	100.00%
2505	\$273.20	\$272.55	100.24%
2601	\$1,051.84	\$1,051.36	100.05%
2602	\$887.32	\$883.83	100.39%
2603	\$312.64	\$305.64	102.29%
2604	\$225.42	\$219.67	102.62%
2605	\$771.61	\$767.61	100.52%
2606	\$391.31	\$383.21	102.11%
2607	\$913.94	\$897.79	101.80%
2608	\$2,915.89	\$2,943.06	99.08%
2609	\$1,420.37	\$1,414.26	100.43%
2610	\$1,674.99	\$1,685.28	99.39%
2611	\$1,957.42	\$1,970.65	99.33%
2701	\$194.26	\$194.26	100.00%
2702	\$307.75	\$308.40	99.79%
2703	\$178.46	\$174.45	102.30%
2704	\$151.08	\$152.05	99.36%

Exhibit 2.A. Fare Box Audits – Actual versus Reported Analysis (Continued)

Bus #	Actual Fares Counted	Reported Fares	Percentage Collected
2705	\$150.37	\$150.37	100.00%
2706	\$203.75	\$205.00	99.39%
2707	\$842.45	\$840.21	100.27%
Grand Total	\$80,770.31	\$79,120.84	102.08%

Exhibit 2.B. Fare Box Audits – Vehicle Listing by Month

Bus #	October		November		December		January		February		March		April		June		July		August		September		TOTAL	
	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count
1404									\$4.00	2	\$0.00	4	\$0.00	1	\$1.00	1							\$5.00	8
1601	\$3.71	2	\$0.25	1			\$16.57	2	\$0.54	1	\$14.44	5					\$4.90	2	\$8.50	4			\$48.91	17
1602	\$4.20	1					\$5.00	1									\$8.00	3	\$4.00	2	\$4.05	3	\$25.25	10
1603	\$8.76	3	\$8.00	2	\$8.99	3	(\$7.91)	2	\$5.20	4	\$1.90	1			\$3.00	1	\$0.00	1	\$3.85	3	\$3.75	2	\$35.54	22
1604	\$1.65	1					\$38.03	4	(\$4.25)	1	\$6.00	1	\$2.55	1	\$4.60	1	\$2.00	3	\$12.02	2	\$5.00	2	\$67.60	16
1605	\$22.99	2	(\$1.00)	1			\$9.00	2	\$17.09	3					\$17.85	2	(\$0.75)	3	(\$4.48)	5			\$60.70	18
1606	\$11.00	2	\$1.00	2	\$13.15	2	\$2.00	1			(\$2.67)	1			\$3.86	2	\$18.20	5	\$5.00	1			\$51.54	16
1701	\$4.65	3	\$0.44	3	\$32.92	5	\$3.39	2	\$17.03	2	\$9.77	2			\$11.00	4							\$79.20	21
1702	\$24.81	3	\$8.09	1	\$3.05	2			\$10.00	3													\$45.95	9
1703							(\$0.75)	1															(\$0.75)	1
1704			\$4.10	2	\$5.09	2									\$6.50	2							\$15.69	6
1705			\$8.54	1	\$0.09	1			\$4.10	2	\$10.15	1			\$4.00	3							\$26.88	8
1706	\$1.16	1			\$0.22	1			\$2.91	2					\$2.85	2							\$7.14	6
1707					\$3.80	1	\$0.08	1	\$8.23	2	\$4.00	1	\$0.00	1	\$4.00	1							\$20.11	7
1708					(\$18.99)	1	\$4.70	3			\$0.50	1											(\$13.79)	5
1709	\$4.85	2	(\$90.25)	3			\$2.30	1	\$4.75	1	\$24.92	4											(\$53.43)	11
1801	\$1.65	3	\$0.20	1			\$19.66	1									\$13.55	6	(\$0.40)	10	\$28.80	3	\$63.46	24
1802	\$0.00	1			\$17.73	4					\$8.02	3			(\$0.22)	2	\$1.00	1	\$4.54	1	\$4.00	1	\$35.07	13
1901	(\$1.88)	2	\$16.10	4	\$20.90	3	\$4.00	2	\$5.20	3	\$0.10	3			\$19.45	5	\$8.25	3	(\$0.85)	3			\$71.27	28
1902	\$13.86	2			\$37.25	2									\$8.00	1	(\$1.00)	2	\$23.99	3			\$82.10	10
1903			\$26.84	5	\$3.75	2			\$26.75	5	\$11.50	3			\$1.18	3	\$31.20	2	\$87.50	2			\$188.72	22
1904	\$8.00	1	\$25.63	6			\$3.27	2	\$3.07	3	\$0.00	1			\$0.51	4	\$18.18	3	\$16.14	2	\$26.62	4	\$101.42	26
1905	\$3.34	1	\$11.76	2	\$7.30	1	\$26.15	5							\$4.00	3	(\$6.93)	4	\$1.00	1	\$19.00	2	\$65.62	19
1906	\$23.76	6							\$0.00	1	\$15.00	2	\$0.00	1	\$1.00	1	\$22.00	3			(\$0.01)	2	\$61.75	16
1907	\$33.91	6	\$5.00	2	\$22.00	4	\$27.29	4	\$3.75	2	\$22.60	4			\$4.10	2	\$14.05	3	\$23.15	7	\$4.20	2	\$160.05	36
1908	\$5.25	3	\$0.02	1	\$12.02	2			\$4.00	1	\$8.00	1			\$3.99	1	\$12.73	4			\$5.74	2	\$51.75	15
1909					\$21.32	2			\$11.09	1	\$4.68	1			\$0.00	1			\$2.97	1			\$40.06	6
2001	(\$0.95)	5			\$0.00	1	(\$0.10)	4	\$0.00	2							(\$2.30)	2	\$2.00	1	(\$0.75)	3	(\$2.10)	18
2002									\$0.00	1							(\$17.45)	2					(\$17.45)	3
2003	(\$3.00)	1																			(\$0.02)	2	(\$3.02)	3
2004			\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1	(\$1.34)	6			\$10.00	1			\$0.00	3			\$0.00	1	(\$0.10)	1	\$8.56	14
2005					\$0.90	1			\$1.00	1	(\$2.74)	2			\$0.00	2							(\$0.84)	6
2006	(\$0.20)	2	(\$0.15)	3	(\$0.10)	3	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	2	\$0.05	2	\$0.00	1			\$0.00	1	\$3.25	6	\$0.30	7	\$3.15	28
2010	\$0.00	1																					\$0.00	1
2100			\$0.00	1																			\$0.00	1
2101					\$0.00	2			\$0.00	1	(\$3.98)	1					\$0.00	1	\$1.00	2	\$12.76	3	\$9.78	10
2102							\$0.00	1									\$1.00	1			\$0.00	1	\$1.00	3
2103															(\$0.10)	1					(\$0.05)	1	(\$0.15)	2
2104	\$0.00	1	\$0.10	1			\$0.00	1	\$11.00	1	(\$11.99)	1			\$0.00	1	\$1.00	1					\$0.11	7
2111	\$0.00	1																					\$0.00	1
2201	\$7.00	1	(\$1.10)	3	\$0.00	2	(\$9.75)	2	\$0.00	1					\$0.00	1	(\$1.00)	3	\$10.75	2	(\$0.25)	2	\$5.65	17
2202	\$0.10	2	\$0.00	3	\$9.90	2	\$0.00	1							(\$0.05)	2					\$0.00	2	\$9.95	12
2203	\$0.25	3					\$0.00	1													(\$10.00)	1	(\$9.75)	5
2204	\$10.00	4	\$0.10	7	(\$1.97)	7	\$0.04	5	(\$0.65)	5	\$0.25	4			\$3.00	5	\$0.00	1	(\$0.01)	7	\$15.62	5	\$26.38	50
2205	\$0.35	3	\$0.00	1	\$5.00	2	\$0.00	3			(\$1.01)	3			(\$1.00)	2	\$0.00	1					\$3.34	15
2206	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1											\$0.00	1							\$0.00	3
2207	\$0.00	1					\$0.00	1			(\$2.00)	1					\$31.29	2			\$0.00	2	\$29.29	7
2208															\$15.24	1	\$3.00	1			\$1.00	1	\$19.24	3
2209															\$3.80	2	(\$10.00)	2			\$0.10	3	(\$6.10)	7
2301			(\$0.25)	2	\$0.00	1	\$0.10	1							\$0.00	1	\$4.00	1					\$3.85	6
2302	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1					\$1.00	1	\$0.00	1			(\$0.15)	1	(\$0.06)	2	(\$0.06)	5	\$0.00	1	\$0.73	13
2303	(\$0.05)	1					(\$0.26)	2	\$1.25	2	\$0.00	1									\$0.00	2	\$0.94	8
2304			(\$4.69)	4	\$8.00	1			(\$4.00)	1					\$0.00	3			\$0.00	4			(\$0.69)	13
2305							\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	2			\$0.00	1			\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	7
2306	(\$0.90)	1									\$6.40	1					\$0.00	1					\$5.50	3
2307	\$3.00	1	\$0.00	2			\$0.00	1			\$0.00	1									\$0.00	1	\$3.00	6
2308	\$0.98	6	\$0.91	6	\$2.35	6	\$4.01	4	\$0.50	3	\$0.00	7			(\$9.86)	2	\$3.75	3	\$0.16	5	\$16.80	4	\$19.60	46
2309	(\$0.01)	3	\$0.00	1			\$0.95	7	(\$0.50)	2	(\$8.55)	6			\$6.90	4	\$7.64	3	\$0.00	1	\$4.85	2	\$11.28	29
2310															\$0.00	1	\$6.17	1	\$5.45	2	\$0.00	1	\$11.62	5

	October		November		December		January		February		March		April		June		July		August		September		TOTAL	
Bus #	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count	Amount	Count
2311	\$0.00	1			\$0.01	2	\$0.00	2	(\$4.02)	1	\$1.00	2			\$10.05	2			\$0.00	1			\$7.04	11
2401	\$2.20	3	(\$1.50)	2	(\$1.99)	4	\$8.91	5	\$1.11	5	(\$0.34)	5			\$0.00	6	(\$0.87)	4	\$0.00	9	(\$0.01)	5	\$7.51	48
2402	\$0.45	2			(\$1.00)	1	\$1.01	5	(\$3.31)	4	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1			\$2.00	1			\$0.00	2	(\$0.85)	17
2403	\$0.10	3	\$0.00	1	\$8.71	1	\$0.00	5	(\$5.00)	4	(\$0.35)	3	\$0.00	1			\$1.54	1	\$0.00	2	(\$4.53)	2	\$0.47	23
2404	\$2.30	5	(\$3.00)	4	\$11.62	12	\$0.00	1			\$22.05	7			\$0.15	2	\$13.90	5	\$5.10	10	\$0.00	2	\$52.12	48
2501	\$2.75	2	(\$1.50)	1	\$0.55	2	\$0.10	4	\$0.00	3	(\$1.00)	1			(\$2.00)	2			\$0.07	2	(\$0.25)	1	(\$1.28)	18
2502			\$0.00	3	(\$0.09)	2	\$0.00	1	(\$0.10)	4	\$10.48	2			(\$0.50)	3	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	2	\$9.79	19
2503	\$0.00	2	\$0.00	2	\$4.82	1	\$0.00	3	\$92.25	2	(\$5.00)	1			\$1.50	2			\$1.00	1			\$94.57	14
2504	\$0.00	1													(\$1.00)	1	\$0.00	1			\$1.00	1	\$0.00	4
2505	(\$0.10)	2							\$0.00	3	\$0.00	1									\$0.75	2	\$0.65	8
2601			\$0.00	1	(\$0.15)	4	\$0.25	3			\$0.00	3	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1	\$0.38	3			\$0.00	2	\$0.48	18
2602	\$0.25	3									(\$0.76)	1			\$0.00	1	\$4.00	2	\$0.00	2	\$0.00	1	\$3.49	10
2603	\$0.00	1					\$0.00	1			\$0.00	1									\$7.00	1	\$7.00	4
2604	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	2							\$5.75	1									\$0.00	2	\$5.75	6
2605	\$0.00	1	(\$3.00)	2	\$7.00	3	\$0.00	2	\$0.00	1					\$0.00	2			\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1	\$4.00	13
2606	\$0.00	1	\$0.10	1	\$0.00	1			\$8.00	1							\$0.00	1			\$0.00	1	\$8.10	6
2607	\$11.05	2					\$1.10	5	\$0.00	2	\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1			\$4.00	2					\$16.15	13
2608	(\$7.25)	4	\$16.38	4	\$0.00	4	\$0.54	5	\$0.17	5	(\$7.01)	4					(\$30.00)	2			\$0.00	1	(\$27.17)	29
2609	\$4.00	2	\$2.00	4	\$0.00	4			(\$0.90)	3	\$1.00	3			\$0.11	8	\$0.00	1	(\$0.10)	4			\$6.11	29
2610	(\$0.05)	2	(\$9.99)	4	\$0.00	2	(\$0.25)	2	(\$5.00)	2	\$0.00	2			\$0.00	3					\$5.00	2	(\$10.29)	19
2611	\$1.01	1	(\$6.11)	1			\$0.00	1	(\$9.45)	2	\$0.42	3	\$0.00	1	\$0.90	2			\$0.00	1	\$0.00	1	(\$13.23)	13
2701															(\$0.01)	2	\$0.01	2			\$0.00	1	\$0.00	5
2702															(\$0.10)	1					(\$0.55)	2	(\$0.65)	3
2703																			\$2.00	3	\$2.01	1	\$4.01	4
2704																		(\$1.01)	1	\$0.04	1	(\$0.97)	2	
2705																	\$0.00	1			\$0.00	1	\$0.00	2
2706																			(\$1.25)	1	\$0.00	1	(\$1.25)	2
2707															\$1.25	1	\$0.00	2	\$0.00	4	\$0.99	2	\$2.24	9
Grand Total	\$208.95	123	\$13.02	106	\$244.15	110	\$158.09	121	\$206.81	105	\$151.58	115	\$2.55	10	\$120.80	114	\$176.38	105	\$102.79	124	\$264.35	112	\$1,649.47	1,145

Exhibit 2.C. Fare Box Audits – Vehicle Listing by Day of Week

Bus #	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday	Grand Total
2204		12	10	9	9	9	1	50
2401		7	10	13	11	7		48
2404		9	8	6	10	14	1	48
2308		8	10	7	9	10	2	46
1907		5	7	4	9	5	6	36
2609		4	5	7	4	5	4	29
2608		6	4	4	5	8	2	29
2309		2	6	8	7	4	2	29
1901		5	3	3	4	6	7	28
2006		8	2	5	1	11	1	28
1904		5	3	6	3	2	7	26
1801		5	3	6	4	6		24
2403		1	6	4	3	2	7	23
1903		5	1	6	3	3	4	22
1603		4	4	3	5	4	2	22
1701		7	4	3	5	2		21
2502	1	6	4		4	4		19
1905		1	4	5	3	4	2	19
2610		1	2	1	4	2	9	19
2601			7	4	1	2	4	18
1605		2	4	3	3	4	2	18
2001		3	3	2	5	4	1	18
2501	1	3	3	3	2	2	4	18
1601		3	4	2	2	3	3	17
2402		2	6	3	2	1	3	17
2201		1	4	5	3	4		17
1606		5	1	2	3	3	2	16
1604			3	2	5	1	5	16
1906		1	3	4	3	4	1	16
1908		1	4	1	2	3	4	15
2205		4	3	2	2	4		15
2503		1	2	6	2	1	2	14
2004		5	1	2	2	2	2	14
2304		3	3	2	3	1	1	13
2607	1	2		4	3	3		13
2605				1	1		11	13
2611		4	2	1	5		1	13
1802		3	5	4	1			13
2302		1	4		3	2	3	13
2202		1		2		2	7	12
2311	1	3				4	3	11
1709		3	1		2		5	11
2101			3	4	1	1	1	10
1602		1	2	1	3	1	2	10
2602		2		1	3	1	3	10
1902		2	1	1	1	2	3	10
2707		1	2	3		3		9
1702		2	2	2	1	2		9
2505			2	2	1	1	2	8
1705		1	2	1	2	2		8
2303		2		1	2	2	1	8
1404		1	2	2	1	2		8
2207				2	3		2	7

Exhibit 2.C. Fare Box Audits – Vehicle Listing by Day of Week (Continued)

Bus #	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday	Grand Total
1707				2	1	3	1	7
2209			4	2			1	7
2305		1	1	1		1	3	7
2104		2	2		2	1		7
2604			1	1		1	3	6
2307			1	1	2	1	1	6
2606		2		1	1		2	6
1706		1	1	1	1	1	1	6
2005			1		3		2	6
2301			1	2	3			6
1909		1	1	1		1	2	6
1704		1	1	1			3	6
2701		1	1		1	2		5
2310		1	1			1	2	5
1708		1	1		2		1	5
2203		1		2			2	5
2703		1		2	1			4
2504		1		1	1	1		4
2603		1			1	1	1	4
2102			3					3
2003				1		2		3
2002	1			1		1		3
2702		1	1	1				3
2306			1		1		1	3
2206		1					2	3
2208				2			1	3
2705				2				2
2704		1	1					2
2706		1	1					2
2103			1		1			2
2111						1		1
2100				1				1
2010					1			1
1703			1					1
Grand Total	5	183	201	201	198	193	164	1,145